K.R. NORMAN

VUTTHĀPETI, VUTŢHĀNA, AND RELATED MATTERS

I. Introduction

In Pāli literature, especially in the Vinaya-piṭaka including the Pātimokkha and in their commentaries, the Samantapāsādikā and Kankhāvitaraṇī respectively, we find a number of occurrences of *vutthāpeti*, *vuṭṭhāna* and kindred words.

In her recent publication Shih has a section entitled "*Vuṭṭhāna* in the Bhikkhunī Pātimokkha" ¹, at the beginning of which she examines the various usages of *vuṭṭhāti* and its variants in the Pātimokkha ².

To some extent her discussion is complicated by her decision ³ to subsume all the variants under the head of *vuṭṭhāpeti*. She states that *vuṭṭhāpeyya* occurs in both Saṅgh 2 (N) and Pāc 61–83 (N) ⁴, but elsewhere she says: "For example the word *vuṭṭhāna* appears in Saṅgh 2 (N) and the twenty-three Pāc rules on admitting female members into the Saṅgha" ⁵. These statements are somewhat misleading, since the word *vuṭṭhāna* does not appear in any of the Bhikkhunī Pātimokkha rules, nor does *vuṭṭhāpeyya* appear in all of them: Pāc 68 (N) and 70 (N) have *vuṭṭhāpetvā*, Pāc 69 (N) has *vuṭṭhāpitaṃ*, and Pāc 76 (N) has *vuṭṭhāpitena*.

^{1.} Sнін, pp. 372-405.

^{2.} Sнін, рр. 372–75.

^{3.} SHIH, p. 372, note 38.

^{4.} Sнін, р. 372.

^{5.} Ѕнін, р. 26.

There is clearly a need for further investigation into this matter. Although an examination of the contexts in which these various words are used indicates that the basic meaning can generally be taken to mean "rise, stand up" in the very broadest sense, it would appear that semantic development cannot explain all the usages, and in particular some of the very extreme differences of meaning, e.g. <code>vutthāpeti</code> is translatable as both "receives" and "removes", while <code>vutthāna</code> may mean both "arising" and "rehabilitation", are difficult to explain.

In this short paper I should like to examine some of these usages, to try to find an explanation for these wide disparities. The examples given are merely illustrative and are in no way intended to be comprehensive.

II. Sanskrit and Pāli equivalents

It may be helpful to start by comparing some of the parallel usages in Skt. There the related words are made from $\sqrt{sth\bar{a}}$ - with different prefixes.

(a) Skt: $ut + \sqrt{sth\bar{a}}$ -:

Roth lists *utthāsyāmi*, *utthāpayanti*, *utthāpīyanti*, *utthāya*, *utthita*, *utthihitavyam* ⁶, some of which are found in classical Skt, while others are restricted to BHS.

(b) Pāli:

The Pāli equivalents usually have the stem vutth-, with an initial v- developed euphonically, although parallel forms from utth- are sometimes found.

^{6.} Rотн, р. 346.

```
vuţţhāti:
```

```
paṭhamanipanno vuṭṭhāti, Kkh 84,35 ("rises up"); cf. aṅkuraṃ ...
    utthāti, Kkh (Ee) 175,14
    megho vutthāti, Kkh 202,15 ("a cloud arises")
    vutthāti, Patis I 66,23 foll. ("emerges")
vutthahati:
    sabbāpattiyo vutthahanti, Kkh 155,33 ("all offences arise [again ?]");
    cf. yāva jālā na uṭṭhahati, Kkh (Ee) 120,29
    vutthahanti, Kkh 202,17 ("they stand up")
    satisammosā vuṭṭhahanti, Vin II 114,22 ("they got up carelessly")
    vutthahanto, Vin II 142,1 ("as he was getting up")
vutthāsi:
     gabbho vuṭṭhāsi, Vin II 278,27 ("the embryo was born")
vutthita:
     vuṭṭhitaṃ pilikaṃ, Kkh 25,12 ("a boil which has risen")
     āsanā vutthitena katam, Kkh 107,22 ("done by one risen from his
     seat")
     parisāya vuṭṭhitāya, Kkh 10,14 ("the assembly having risen"); cf.
     a-vuṭṭhitāya, Kkh 10,13 ("not yet risen")
 vuṭṭhātum:
     na sakkoma vuṭṭhātuṃ, Vin II 165,33 ("we are unable to get up")
```

vuṭṭhātabba:

āsanā vuṭṭhātabbaṃ, Vin II 22,33 ("there is to be a rising from the seat")

vutthahitvā:

ito vutthahitvā, Kkh 16,38 foll. = Vin I 126,25–26 ("having risen from here"); cf. utthahitvā, Kkh 84,36

vuṭṭhāya:

āsanā vuṭṭhāya, Vism 126,23 ("having risen from the seat"); cf. sayaṃ uṭṭhāya, Kkh 85,37

vuţţhitvā:

vuṭṭhitvā, Paṭis I 66,35 foll. ("having emerged")

vutthāna:

gabbha-vuṭṭhāna, Ja I 114,20 ("emergence, birth of the embryo"); cf. jāl'-uṭṭhāna, Kkh 120,29; uṭṭhānādhippayo, Kkh 202,17 (v.l.)

vuṭṭhāna-gāminī vipassanā, Vism 661,12 ("insight leading to emergence [of the path])"

vutthahana:

vutthahanato, Vism 661,17 ("because of emergence")

vuţţhāpeti:

vuṭṭhāpesi, -essati, -essati, -essasi, -etabbo, -eyya, -eti, -enti, -etvā, Vin II 165,6 foll. (Horner: "turned away" ⁷)

^{7.} HORNER, BD V, p. 230.

a-vuṭṭhāpanīyā, Vin II 166,1 ("not to be turned away")

chabbaggiyā bhikkhū bhaṇḍāgārikaṃ vuṭṭhāpenti ... na bhikkhave bhaṇḍāgāriko vuṭṭhāpetabbo ... yo vuṭṭhāpeyya, Vin I 285,2–5 (Horner: "turned away" 8); cf. vuḍḍhatarā uṭṭhāpenti, Kkh 91,39 ("older people turn him out")

bhikkhum vuṭṭhāpetvā (Ee u°), Kkh 132,28 ("having had this bhikkhu removed"); cf. therā ... Rāhulattherassa vasanaṭṭhānaṃ gantvā uṭṭhāpesuṃ (Be and Ee so), Dhp-a IV 69,12–14 (Burlingame: "woke him up" 9)

majjhe paṭibhānacittaṃ vuṭṭhāpetvā, Vin IV 61,5 (Horner: "having raised up a bold design in the middle" 10)

- (2) "to rise from (with a suggestion of separation)"
- (a) Skt vy- $ut + \sqrt{sth\bar{a}}$ 11:

MW, s.v. *vy-ut-thā*: "to turn away from (+ ablative), give up, abandon, to swerve from duty, forget one's self".

BHSD, s.v. *vyuttiṣṭhati*: "returns (to normal life), comes out (from meditative seclusion)"

MW, s.v. vyutthāna: "rising up, awakening (a particular stage in Yoga)"

BHSD, s.v. *vyutthāpana*: "causing to get rid of"; *anyonyāpatti-vyutthāpanād*, Prāt 486.12 ("through helping one another to be rid of sin")

^{8.} HORNER, BD IV, p. 403, note 2: "made get up, removed".

^{9.} Burlingame, III, p. 234.

^{10.} HORNER, BD II, p. 285.

^{11.} As noted in PED, s.v. vutthahati.

Roth: anyamanya-vacanīyā anyamanyāpatti-vyutthāpanīyā 12.

Nolot translates: "par les conseils mutuels, par le soutien mutuel pour se défaire de ses fautes" ¹³.

Hirakawa translates the Chinese equivalent: "ought to instruct each other in turn, and admonish each other in turn" ¹⁴.

Roth: āpattim āpannām vyutthāpayitum vā vyutthāpāyayitum vā 15.

Nolot translates: "inciter, ou faire inciter, celle qui a commis une faute à s'en défaire." 16

Hirakawa translates: "to help others to purify themselves of their offences." 17

BHSD, s.v. *vyuttiṣṭhati*: (3) "recovers, as from an illness or weariness"; (4) "arises, sets out on a journey".

(b) Pāli:

The Pāli equivalents have the stem vuṭṭh-.

vuṭṭhaha:

sakāya āpattiyā vuṭṭhaha, Vin I 128,3,23 (Rhys Davids & Oldenberg: "atone for your own offence" 18)

vutthahitvā:

samādhimhā vuṭṭhahitvā, Vin I 2,29 (Horner: "having emerged from contemplation" ¹⁹)

^{12.} Roth, § 169.

^{13.} Nolot, р. 147.

^{14.} HIRAKAWA, p. 175.

^{15.} Roth, § 207.

^{16.} Nolot, p. 252.

^{17.} HIRAKAWA, p. 290.

^{18.} RHYS DAVIDS & OLDENBERG, p. 285.

^{19.} HORNER, BD IV, p. 5.

vuţthāsi:

gāmo corehi vuṭṭhāsi, Vin I 149,18 ("The village (i.e. the villagers) went away, i.e. moved away, migrated, because of thieves")

vuṭṭhita:

- (i) (of the offence): asantī nāma āpatti anajjhāpannā vā hoti āpajjitvā vā vuṭṭhitā, Vin I 103,27–28 (Horner: "If there is no offence means: either one comes not to be committed or, if fallen into, it is removed" ²⁰); cf. santī nāma āpatti anajjhāpannā vā hoti āpajjitvā vā avuṭṭhitā, Vin I 103,37 ("it is not removed")
- (ii) (of the offender): anajjhāpanno vā hoti āpajjitvā vā vuṭṭhito ti ettha yaṃ āpattiṃ bhikkhu anajjhāpanno vā hoti āpajjitvā vā vuṭṭhito, ayaṃ asantī nāma āpatti, Sp 1034,28–30 (Horner: "Here, either, whatever monk there comes to be not falling into an offence, or, having fallen is removed from it, this is the meaning of 'if there is no offence'" 21)

vuṭṭhātu(ṃ):

anujānāmi tā āpattiyo vuṭṭhātuṃ, Vin III 35,17,23 ("I allow those offences to be removed")

vuṭṭhātukāmena, Kkh 16,35 (= Vin I 104,11) ("by one desirous of being rehabilitated")

vutthāna:

āpattivuṭṭhānaṃ, Kkh 35,22 ("rehabilitation from an offence" 22)

āpattiyā vuṭṭhānaṃ, Vin I 64,12 ("rehabilitation from an offence")

^{20.} HORNER, BD IV, p. 134.

^{21.} HORNER, BD IV, p. 134, note 1.

^{22.} ÑĀŅAMOLI, s.v. vuṭṭhāna.

vuṭṭḥānādhippāyo, Kkh 43,12 ("intention of rehabilitation"); E^e uṭṭh° would appear to be a mistake; cf. vuṭṭhānādhippāyena, Kkh 44,7

vuṭṭhāna, Mil 344,7 (Horner: "The removal [of offences"] 23)

vuṭṭhān' assa āgametabbam, Vin I 50,24 ("his recovery [from illness] is to be awaited")

vuṭṭhāpetabba:

vuṭṭhānagāminiyā vuṭṭhāpetabbo, Kkh 129,23 ("he is to be rehabilitated by the path going to rehabilitation")

na ca tena mūlena vuṭṭhāpetabbaṃ, A IV 347,13 ("let him not gain rehabilitation on any grounds")

vutthāpana:

aññamaññavacanena aññamaññavuṭṭhāpanena "by dissuading one another (from evil) by speaking to one another", Pāt 20,1 = Vin III 178,13.

so bahujanam saddhammā vuṭṭhāpetvā asaddhamme patiṭṭhāpeti, A III 114, 27–29: "He turns many folk away from true doctrine and sets them in what is not true doctrine"; cf. so bahujanam asaddhammā vuṭṭhāpetvā saddhamme patiṭṭhāpeti, A III 115, 23–24.

(3) "to serve, take care of"

(a) Skt $upa + \sqrt{sth\bar{a}}$ -:

Cf. MW: upa-sthā- "to serve, be of service to"

^{23.} Horner, 1964, p. 194, note 5.

Roth: $gil\bar{a}nam\ upasthihitum\ v\bar{a}\ upasth\bar{a}payitum\ v\bar{a}^{24}$.

Nolot translates: "elle sait veiller ou faire veiller sur celle qui est malade" ²⁵.

Hirakawa translates: "to nurse or have someone nurse" 26.

There is a development of the usage of this verb in a religious context, signifying a particular relationship between a bhikkhunī and a trainee aspiring to ordination.

Roth: upasthāpayitum ²⁷.

Nolot translates: "prenne en charge (une probationnaire)" ²⁸ and "prendre en charge" ²⁹.

Hirakawa translates: "take (on) disciples" 30.

Roth: upasthāpanā-saṃmuti 31.

Nolot translates: "agrément pour la prise en charge" ³². Hirakawa translates: "permission to take a disciple" ³³.

(b) Pāli:

(i) In the simple sense the Pāli equivalent is upaṭṭh- 34.

upaṭṭheyya, Pāt 174,12 ("should attend to")

upajjhāyo ... yāvajīvaṃ upaṭṭhātabbo, Vin I 50,24 ("is to be attended")

^{24.} Rотн, § 207.

^{25.} Nolot, p. 252.

^{26.} Hirakawa, p. 291.

^{27.} Rотн, §§ 207, 213.

^{28.} Nolot, p. 251.

^{29.} NOLOT, p. 263.

^{30.} Hirakawa, p. 289. 31. Roth, § 28.

^{32.} Nolot, р. 17.

^{33.} HIRAKAWA, p. 56.

^{34.} For the range of forms from this stem in Pāli, see NPED, s.v. *upaṭṭhaka*, and following entries.

upaṭṭhāna Kkh 184,26 ("service, attention"); cf. an-upaṭṭhāna, Kkh 185,2 ("lack of attention")

upaṭṭhāpanāya ussukkaṃ kareyya, Pāt 174,13 ("should make an effort to have (her) attended to")

(ii) The special relationship form in Pāli is vuṭṭhāpeti.

The translation of the various forms from *vuṭṭhāpeti* has caused problems for translators. Shih states: "*Vuṭṭhāna* is understood by the commentator(s) as full ordination" ³⁵. Horner says, more accurately, "*vuṭṭhāpeti* (is) always explained by the relevant parts of the Old Commentary as *upasampādeti*" ³⁶, and this presumably accounts for the fact that she translates it as "ordains" in every rule except Saṅgh 2 (N) where, as she explains, it would appear to mean neither *upasampādeti* nor *pabbajati*. She accordingly translates *vuṭṭhāpeyya* in that rule as "should receive" ³⁷.

Shih follows Horner in using the translation "receive" in most contexts, but prefers to use "ordain" for $P\bar{a}c$ 64 (N), 67 (N), and 73 (N) ³⁸.

Hüsken translates: "(in den Orden) aufnimmt, aufgenommen hat, aufnehmen, Aufnahme" ³⁹, while, as noted above, Nolot also prefers to be more consistent in her translations of the Skt equivalent.

It is clearly unsatisfactory to have two different translations for the same word in the same context. The idea of a single bhikkhunī ordaining someone is clearly unacceptable, since ordination is a matter for the Sangha, and therefore "ordains" would seem to be incorrect in all contexts. On the other hand, "receive" or "prendre" would seem to be rather secular in its implications.

^{35.} Ѕнін, р. 263.

^{36.} HORNER, BD III, p. xlv.

^{37.} HORNER, BD III, p. 183. 38. Shih, p. 264.

^{39.} HÜSKEN, pp. 75, etc.

It is for that reason that Pruitt & Norman, in an attempt to find something intermediate between "receive" and "ordain", decided to use "sponsor (for ordination)" ⁴⁰, just as one might say "put someone up, i.e. nominate, for membership".

```
vuṭṭhāpeti:
```

vesim vuṭṭhāpenti, Vin II 267,8 ("they sponsored a courtesan")

vuṭṭhāpetvā:

Pāt 184,21 ("having sponsored")

vuṭṭhāpeyya:

Pāt 124,13 ("should sponsor")

vuṭṭhāpessāmi:

na vuṭṭhāpessāmi, Kkh 201,1 ("I shall not sponsor")

vuṭṭhāpentiyā:

Kkh 162,15-16, ("by one sponsoring")

vuṭṭhāpana:

vuṭṭhāpana: Kkh 162,17 ("sponsoring")

na vutihāpanāya ussukkam kareyya, Pāt 188,8 ("should not make an effort for sponsoring [her]"); cf. Kkh 201,1, where S^1 reads upaṭṭhāpanāya

sikkhamāna-vuṭṭhāpana, Pāt 188,5,10 ("sponsoring a trainee")

^{40.} Pruitt & Norman, p. xliv.

cori-vuṭṭhāpana, Kkh 162,13 ("sponsoring a thief")

gabbhinī-vuṭṭhāpana, Kkh 197,1 ("sponsoring a pregnant woman")

vuṭṭhāpana-sammuti, Vin IV 330,34 ("agreement as to sponsor-ship")

The compound *vuṭṭhāpana-sammuti* occurs, with reference to bhikkhunīs, at Vin IV 330,10 (ad Pāc 75 [N]) and 331,8 (ad Pāc 76 [N]). Shih translates it as "agreement to receive (pupils)", although she states (ad Pāc 76 [N]) that "to receive" in this story refers to conferring full ordination ⁴¹. Hüsken translates: "*Erlaubnis*, (*eine Sikkhamānā*) aufzunehmen" ⁴².

vuṭṭhāpita:

Pāt 188,2 (= Pāc 76 [N]): *alaṃ vuṭṭhāpitena* "enough of sponsoring", i.e. the passive past participle is being used as an action noun.

Pāt 184,25 (= Pāc 69 [N]): vuṭṭhāpitaṃ is clearly passive in form, and is glossed by the passive past participle upasampāditaṃ. Horner translates: "Whatever nun should not wait upon an ordained woman instructor" ⁴³, but it is hard to believe that an instructor should not already be ordained, and even more difficult to believe if we take vuṭṭhāpitaṃ as "sponsored". Consequently, other translators have taken vuṭṭhapitaṃ as active, although the form of the Pāli precludes it. Shih translates "attend on the female tutor who has had (her) received" ⁴⁴. Hüsken translates as "der Pavattinī, die (sie in den Orden) aufgenommen hat" ⁴⁵.

^{41.} SHIH, p. 319, note 158.

^{42.} HÜSKEN, p. 270.

^{43.} HORNER, BD III, p. 377.

^{44.} Ѕнін, р. 301.

^{45.} HÜSKEN, p. 262.

If this is indeed the correct way to understand this rule, then the Pāli version is probably derived from $y\bar{a}$ pana bhikkhunī vuṭṭhāpikaṃ pavattiniṃ nānubandheyya "if any bhikkhunī should not serve the preceptor who sponsored her". We might assume an earlier form *vuṭṭhāpiyaṃ, the -y- of which was variously interpreted as -t- or -k-. There are other examples in Buddhist literature of such varying interpretations ⁴⁶.

The other versions of this rule differ. Roth reads: $y\bar{a}$ puna bhikṣuṇī upasthāyikā upasthāpitāṃ ... nāvavadeya nānuśāset ⁴⁷, which Nolot translates: "si une nonne qui a la charge ... n'exhorte ni n'éduque ... celle qu'elle a prise en change" ⁴⁸. Hirakawa translates: "a bhikṣuṇī ought to give her disciple some moral instruction" ⁴⁹.

These versions suggest that Pāli *pavattiniṃ* may be a mistake for *pavattinī*, and that there has been a change in the word order. If the order was originally *bhikkhunī pavattinī vuṭṭhāpitaṃ*, then the meaning would have been very similar to that of Hirakawa's text.

For vuṭṭhāpikā see the next item.

vuṭṭhāpikā:

corī-vuṭṭhāpikā-sikkhāpadaṃ, Pāt 124,10 ("The rule about one sponsoring a woman thief")

vuţţhāna:

As noted above, *vuṭṭhāna* does not appear at all in the Bhikkhunī Pātimokkha, nor in the Bhikkhu Pātimokkha.

^{46.} NORMAN, p. 389, note 84.

^{47.} Rотн, § 218.

^{48.} Nolot, р. 269.

^{49.} Hirakawa, p. 314.

134 K.R. Norman

It occurs in the compound *vuṭṭhāna-sammuti* at Vin IV 320,31 where it is used in connection with a probationer who has received training. It is, therefore, a stage beyond *sikkhā-sammuti*.

At Kkh (E^e) 200,12 (ad Pāc 76 [N]) the compound *vuṭṭhāna-sammuti* would appear to be an error for *vuṭṭhāpana-sammuti*, since that is the reading at 200,9 (ad Pāc 75 [N]) and 200, 16,21 (ad Pāc 76 [N]) in E^e , and in all four places in B^e .

Since the causative noun *vuṭṭhāpana* is used of the bhikkhunī, it would seem logical for the simple noun *vuṭṭhāna* to be used of the recipient of the act of *vuṭṭhāpana*. As Shih states ⁵⁰, *vuṭṭhāna* requires a passive meaning. It would therefore mean "(agreement about) being sponsored (for ordination)", or in Shih's terminology "being received". Hüsken translates: "*Erlaubnis zur Aufnahme*" ⁵¹.

That there is a difference between *vuṭṭhāna* and ordination is shown by the Word Analysis (Vin IV 321,16), which states that *vuṭṭhāna-sammuti* is given by a *ñatti-dutiya-kamma*, whereas, as Shih states ⁵², the request for ordination is expressed through a *ñatti-catuttha-kamma*.

As already noted, the commentarial tradition clearly did not know the meaning of the verb *vuṭṭḥāpeti*. As Shih points out ⁵³, the background stories may have little value for understanding the origin of a certain rule, or sometimes even its meaning. I would go further, and say that to use any story to give an atypical meaning to the verb *vuṭṭḥāpeti* is incorrect. I assume that, in the same context, the verb always has the same meaning, i.e. in the same context it cannot sometimes mean "receive" and sometimes "ordain".

^{50.} Shih, p. 294 note 83. It is surprising that this note is given *ad* Vin IV 324,5 (Pāc 67 [N]), and not when the term first ocurs in Vin IV 320,21 (Pāc 64 [N]).

^{51.} HÜSKEN, p. 254.

^{52.} SHIH, p. 288, note 65.

^{53.} SHIH, p. 26.

I conclude that where vuṭṭhāna appears in Vin and Kkh 54 with reference to probationers it does not mean "full ordination".

III. Conclusions

Although these differences in meaning arise in some contexts from semantic development, it appears that sometimes the Pali words are derived from different Skt verbs.

We may conclude that forms based on vuṭṭh- in Pāli are derivatives from:

(1) $ut + \sqrt{sth\bar{a}}$:

The occurrence of forms with and without initial v- suggests that it is euphonic.

(2) vy- $ut + \sqrt{sth\bar{a}}$ -:

Here v- is the development of vv- < vy- in initial position.

(3) $upa + \sqrt{sth\bar{a}}$:

In Pāli upa- is sometimes replaced by \bar{u} - 55. It is possible, therefore, that $upa-tth^{\circ} > *\bar{u}-tth^{\circ} > u-tth^{\circ}$, with the usual shortening of a long vowel before a double consonant. Alsdorf regarded these \bar{u} forms as protocanonical Eastern forms surviving in Western Pāli 56, and if this is so it would explain why the technical mea-

^{54.} The word does not occur in Sp (Ee), but where Ee has sikkhāsammuti at Sp 940,25, Be has vuṭṭhāna-sammuti. In the commentary on this rule (Pāc 64 [N]), Kkh 198,2 has upasampadā-sammuti, showing the usual commentarial confusion of vutthāna and upasampadā. The occurrence of Skt upasthāpanā "the act of ordaining (a monk)", quoted from an unnamed Jain source in MW, s.v., suggests the possibility of this confusion occurring among the Jains also. An examination of the use of this and kindred terms in Jain literature might help to clarify the situation.

⁵⁵ See CPD, s.v. $3\bar{u}$.

^{56.} ALSDORF, p. 115. He notes (p. 117) that this change occurs in Pāli only before h. If my suggestion is correct, then his view must be modified.

ning of *upaṭṭh*° has the Eastern form, since it would have been retained from the language of early Buddhism.

We may assume that the occurrence of v- before utth- is euphonic.

Although there are contexts where the precise meaning is not always clear, for the most part there is no confusion between these various usages.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

(Where an author is represented in this list by a single publication the year of publication is omitted in references)

ALSDORF, L., 1975, "Pāli Miscellanies", in StII 1, pp. 109-17

BURLINGAME, E.W., 1921, Buddhist Legends, 3 Vols., Harvard

CONE, M., 2001, A Dictionary of Pāli, Vol. I, PTS Oxford

EDGERTON, E., 1953, Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary, New Haven

HIRAKAWA, Akira, 1982, Monastic Discipline for the Buddhist Nuns: an English translation of the Chinese text of the Mahāsāṃghika Bhikṣuṇī-Vinaya, Patna

HORNER, I.B., 1938–66, *The Book of the Discipline*, 6 Vols., SBB London —, 1964, *Milinda's Questions*, Vol. II, SBB London

HÜSKEN, U., 1997, Die Vorschriften für die buddhistische Nonnengemeinde im Vinaya-Piṭaka der Theravādin, Berlin

MASKELL, D., 1956, Kankhāvitaranī, PTS London

Monier-Williams, M., 1899, Sanskrit-English Dictionary, Oxford

ÑĀṇAMOLI, Bhikkhu, 1994, A Pali-English Glossary of Buddhist Technical Terms, Kandy

NOLOT, E., 1991, Règles de Discipline des Nonnes Bouddhistes, Paris

NORMAN, K.R., 1989, "Dialect forms in Pāli", in C. Caillat (ed.): *Dialectes dans les littératures indo-aryennes*, Paris, pp. 369–92

OLDENBERG, H., 1879-83, Vinaya-Piṭaka, 5 Vols., London

PRUITT, W. & NORMAN, K.R., 2001, The Pātimokkha, PTS Oxford

RHYS DAVIDS, T.W. & OLDENBERG, H., 1881, Vinaya Texts, Part I, Oxford

Roth, G., 1970, Bhikṣuṇī-Vinaya, including Bhikṣuṇī-Prakīrṇaka and a summary of the Bhikṣu-Prakīrṇaka of the Ārya-Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādin, Patna

SHIH, Bhikkhunī Juo-Hsüeh, 2000, Controversies over Buddhist Nuns, PTS Oxford

ABBREVIATIONS

The abbreviations of the titles of $P\bar{a}li$ texts are those adopted by CPD. References are to PTS editions, except where stated otherwise. The inclusion of E^e implies that the reading is found in the PTS edition, but not in other editions.

BD = HORNER, 1938-66

Be = Burmese (Chaṭṭhasaṅgāyana) edition

BHS = Buddhist Hybrid Skt BHSD = EDGERTON, 1953

CPD = A Critical Pāli Dictionary E° = European (i.e. PTS) edition MW = MONIER-WILLIAMS, 1899

NPED = Cone, 2001

Pāc (N)=(Bhikkhunī) Pācittiya rulePāt=PRUITT & NORMAN, 2001PED=PTS's Pali-English Dictionary

PTS = Pali Text Society

Saṅgh (N) = (Bhikkhunī) Saṅghādisesa rule SBB = Sacred Books of the Buddhists

Skt = Sanskrit

s.v. = under the heading v.l. = variant reading