

Edition) another legendary tradition about the three aims of life (and *mokṣa*, redemption as the fourth) is given.

We insert here a juxtaposition of the *Kāmasūtra* and *Mahābhārata* traditions:

| | | | | |
|--|--------------|-------------------------|--------------|-----------|
| <i>Kāmasūtra</i> I, 1 | | | | |
| Prajāpati (100,000 chapters) | | | | |
| (three aims) | | | | |
| <i>dharma</i> | <i>artha</i> | <i>kāma</i> (1,000 ch.) | | |
| (Manu Svāyambhuva) | (Bṛhaspati) | (Nandin) | | |
| Auddālaki Śvetaketu (500 ch.) | | | | |
| Bābhavya (150 ch.), in seven | | | | |
| main sections, treated separately | | | | |
| 6 | 1 | 2 | 3 | by 4 |
| Dattaka | Cārāyaṇa | Suvarṇanābha | Ghoṭakamukha | Gonardīya |
| 5 | | | | |
| Goṇikāputra | | | | |
| 7 | | | | |
| Kucumāra | | | | |
| the whole condensed by: | | | | |
| Vātsyāyana (36 ch. in seven main sections) | | | | |

Mahābhārata XII, 59, 28-30 and 86-91 (Critical Edition)

Svayambhū, viz. Brahman (100,000 chapters)

(three aims and redemption)

Śiva Viśālākṣa (10,000 ch., Vaiśālākṣam)

Indra (5,000 ch., Bāhudantakam)

Bṛhaspati (3,000 ch., Bārhaspatyam)

Kāvya, viz. Uśanas (1,000 ch.).

We see that a legendary original of 100,000 chapters (*adhyāyas*) is claimed by both texts, but according to the *Kāmasūtra* tradition this work of 100,000 chapters dealt with the three aims of life which were treated separately afterwards, whereas in the *Mahābhārata* tradition (XII, 59, 30 and 85) redemption (*mokṣa*) too belonged to the contents of this legendary work. However, this work is there called *daṇḍanīti* (*Mahābhārata* XII, 59, 78 f.), and the enumerated topics refer in most cases to political problems, so that Kane³ and others interpret this report as the tradition of political science. Actually Bṛhaspati is elsewhere known as political teacher (e.g. in the *Kāmasūtra*) and in the list of experts on *rājādharma* (king's duty) in *Mahābhārata* XI, 58, 1 f. we find the following names: Bṛhaspati, Viśālākṣa, Kāvya, Indra, Prācetasu Manu, Bharadvāja and Gaurasīras.

If we compare the tradition in *Kāmasūtra* I, 1 with that in *Mahābhārata* XII, 59 we find that both presuppose an opus magnum composed by the Creator (Prajāpati or Svayambhū). Other Sanskrit treatises

3. *History of Dharmasāstra*, Vol. III, Poona, 1946, p. 4.

too claim divine origin, e.g. the god Brahman is regarded as the founder of the drama (*nāṭya*); a *dharmasūtra* is attributed to Viṣṇu, etc.

We might argue that these texts really existed but were attributed to gods. However, the length of 100,000 chapters is incredible, and even a length of 1,000 chapters is questionable. Vātsyāyana, the author of the *Kāmasūtra*, is not quoting Prajāpati or the servant of Śiva (Nandin) but only Auddālaki and the later authorities. None of these texts is extant any more and that's why we are not able to verify the authenticity of the quotations⁴. Bābhavya Pāñcāla was the founder of a *kāma* school (Bābhaviyāḥ) which Vātsyāyana quotes several times.

According to *Kāmasūtra* I, 3 Pāñcāla (viz. Bābhavya) established the 64 (i.e. 8 times 8) ways of love (Pāñcālī catuḥṣaṣṭih) which are distinguished from the 64 arts (*kalāḥ*). Vātsyāyana accepts the term « Sixty-four » only as a figurative term because the number of the ways of love varies. For Vātsyāyana it is a technical term like the « seven-leaved » tree (*saptaparṇa*) which has more than seven leaves (II, 8).

The individual authors are quoted in those main sections for which they are said to be specialists. Dattaka plays a special role because he is mentioned first in Vātsyāyana's enumeration but is quoted as expert on courtesans (the sixth main section), whereas the other individual authors are enumerated in the order of the main sections. Only in a few cases are they mentioned in an other context, and one of them, the specialist of the seventh main section, is not quoted (Kucumāra)⁵. In most cases the opinions of the individual teachers are quoted without the refutation of Vātsyāyana, e.g. Ghoṭakamukha in the 3rd, Gonardīya in the 4th main section. Such quotations are interpreted by the commentary Jayamaṅgalā: *gonardīya iti pūjārtham adhikaraṇe 'dhikṛtatvāt* (Gonardīya honourably because he is the authority for this *adhikaraṇa*) IV, 32. This is different from the *Arthaśāstra* of Kauṭilya, where in most cases the views of the individual authors are contradicted by another individual author and/or by Kauṭilya.

In the *Arthaśāstra* the individual authors discuss with each other in a stereotyped order. Such debates are no verbatim quotations from extant works. However, they may represent authentic views though their style must be fictitious. In the *Kāmasūtra* stylistic adaptations are less evident⁶. Here the individual authors occur in a stereotyped form only once without refuting each other, viz. *Kāmasūtra* I, 5 treats three types of women (*nāyikās*) to be resorted to; then Goṅikāputra mentions

4. There are only few data on Vātsyāyana's predecessors in Sanskrit literature. These references were compiled by Richard Schmidt, *Beiträge zur indischen Erotik*, Berlin, 1922, § 1 sub voce and by S. C. Upadhyaya, *Kama Sutra of Vatsyayana* (Complete Translation), Bombay, 1961, pp. 47 ff.

5. His name occurs only in I, 3 in the 21st of the 64 arts (*kalāḥ*): *kaucumārāśca yogāḥ*, the tricks of Kucumāra.

6. Though they exist, e.g. in V, 6 Goṅikāputra refers directly to the quotation of the teachers: « *te hi...* ».

a fourth type, and ultimately Cārāyaṇa a fifth, Suvarṇanābha a sixth, Ghoṭakamukha a seventh and Gonardīya an eighth type.

The quotations of the teachers (*ity ācāryāḥ*) have a purport similar to that in the *Arthaśāstra*. These quotations render the views of a varying number of specialists, as do the opinions cited as *ity eke* (some say). Here it goes without saying that the stylistic form must be by the author Vātsyāyana, but there is no clue that their contents are fictitious too. Vātsyāyana refers to opinions which were really represented or to possible objections (to the latter clearly in the form *tatra etaḥ syāt* / it may be objected here [II, 6]). Vātsyāyana expresses in his own words also the views of special groups (materialists, fatalists, and political thinkers [I, 2]), a local custom (*deśasātmyam*, II, 16) or a general opinion (*prāyovadaḥ*, III, 28; V, 40, 43). Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana (i.e. isolated statements without a debate) emphasize Vātsyāyana's standpoint.

The *Kāmasūtra* is far less polemical than the *Arthaśāstra*, where most views are refuted⁷. In the *Kāmasūtra* a greater number of quotations remain undisputed or are only slightly modified. A by-effect of quoting in both texts is to variegate the *bhāṣya* style. The debates in the *Kāmasūtra* are less elaborate, as the *Kāmasūtra* is more concise and closer to the *sūtra* than to the *śāstra* style.

7. See Appendix II. The relations between Kauṭilya and Vātsyāyana were discussed by FRIEDRICH WILHELM, *Die Beziehungen zwischen Kāmasūtra and Arthaśāstra*, in: « Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft », Band 116, 2 (1966), pp. 291-310. On the roll of the quotations in the *Arthaśāstra* see FRIEDRICH WILHELM, *Politische Polemiken im Staatslehrbuch des Kauṭilya*, Wiesbaden, 1960 (further references in both publications).

THE QUOTATIONS IN THE KĀMASŪTRA OF VĀTSYĀYANA

| Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>) | Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>) | Chapters (<i>adhyaḃya</i>) | The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>) | Schools | Individual authors | Other references | Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana without debate |
|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|---|--|
| I sādhāranākhyam (General) | 1 | (1) | | | | to V.'s predecessors laukayatikāḥ + V. (materialists) Kālakāraṇikāḥ + V. (fatalists) and arthacintakāḥ + V. (political thinkers) | |
| | 2 | (2) | once + V. | | | | |
| | 3 | (3) | once + V. | | (Kucumāra) // (Pañcālā) Cārāyana | | |
| | 4 | (4) | | | Goṇikāputra // | | |
| | 5 | (5) | | Bābhraṇṇiyāḥ + Goṇikāputra | | | once |
| | | | | | Suvarṇanābha + Ghotakamukha + Gonardiya + V. + eke (some) | | |
| II sāmprayogikam (on sexual union) | 6 | (1) | once | Bābhraṇṇiyāḥ | Auddālaki (twice) Bābhraṇṇiya (Śloka according to Commentary) | three times: tatra etat syāt (it may be objected here) + tacca na (this is not the case) prāyovādaḥ (general opinion) | once |

| <i>Main sections (adhikaraṇa)</i> | <i>Topics (prakaraṇa)</i> | <i>Chapters (aḥyāna)</i> | <i>The teachers (ācāryāḥ)</i> | <i>Schools</i> | <i>Individual authors</i> | <i>Other references</i> | <i>Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana without debate</i> |
|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|-------------------------------|---|---|
| | 7 | (1) | | | | tantrajñāḥ (experts of kāmāntara) twice in stanza ity ācaṣṭe (they call) + ācāryavādāḥ (the opinion of the teachers) + eke (some) + Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + V. // eke (some) + V. | |
| | 8 | (2) | | Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + Suvarṇanābha | (Pāñcāla) | | |
| | 9 | (3) | | | | | |
| | 10 | (4) | once + V. | | Suvarṇanābha | | twice |
| | 11 | (5) | | | | | |
| | 12 | (5) | | | Suvarṇanābha | | |
| | 13 | (6) | | Bābhraṇvīyāḥ + Sauvarṇanābhaḥ (the different positions called...) | Suvarṇanābha + V. | | |
| | 14 | (6) | | | | | |
| | 15 | (7) | | | | | |
| | 16 | (7) | | | | | |
| | 17 | (8) | | | | | |
| | 18 | (8) | | | | deśasātmīyam etad (this is a local custom) + V. | |

| Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>) | Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>) | Chapters (<i>adhyāya</i>) | The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>) | Schools | Individual authors | Other references | Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana without debate |
|---|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--|
| | 19 | (9) | once + V. | | | evam hy āhuḥ (thus they say) + V. | |
| | 20 | (10) | | | | | |
| | 21 | (10) | | | | | |
| | 22 | (10) | | | | | |
| | 23 | (1) | | | Dattaka // (Bābhravya) Ghoṭakamukha (twice) | | |
| III kanyāsaṃ- prayuktakam (acquisition of a wife) | 24 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 25 | (2) | | Bābhravyāḥ + V. | Ghoṭakamukha (twice) Ghoṭakamukha | | |
| | 26 | (3) | | | | | |
| | 27 | (3) | | | | | |
| | 28 | (4) | | | Ghoṭakamukha | prāyovādaḥ (general opinion) | once |
| | 29 | (4) | once | | | | |
| | 30 | (4) | | | | | |
| | 31 | (5) | once | | | | |
| IV bhāryādihikārikam (on married women) | 32 | (1) | | | Gonardiya (twice) | | |
| | 33 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 34 | (2) | | | | | |
| | 35 | (2) | | | | | |
| | 36 | (2) | | Bābhravyāḥ + Gonardiya + V. | Gonardiya | | |
| | 37 | (2) | | | | | |
| | 38 | (2) | | | | | |
| | 39 | (2) | | | | | |

| Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>) | Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>) | Chapters (<i>adhyāya</i>) | The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>) | Schools | Individual authors | Other references | Self-quotations of <i>Vātsyāyana</i> without debate |
|---|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------|---|
| V pāradārikam (on other men's wives) | 40 | (1) | once + V. | | Goṅikāputra | prāyovādah (general opinion) | |
| | 41 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 42 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 43 | (2) | once + V. | | | prāyovādah (general opinion) | |
| | 44 | (2) | | | | | |
| | 45 | (3) | | Bābhravīyāḥ + V. // | Auddālaki + Bābhravīyāḥ + | | |
| | 46 | (4) | | Bābhravīyāḥ + Goṅikāputra + V. | Goṅikāputra + V. // Goṅikāputra | | |
| | 47 | (5) | | | | | |
| | 48 | (6) | | | | | |
| | 49 | (6) | once + Goṅikāputra + V. | Bābhravīyāḥ + V. | | | once |
| VI vaiśikam (on courtesans) | 50 | (1) | once + V. | | | | |
| | 51 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 52 | (2) | | | | | |
| | 53 | (3) | once + V. | | Dattaka (Dattaka implicite) | | |
| | 54 | (3) | | | | | |
| | 55 | (3) | | | | | |
| | 56 | (4) | once + V. | | Dattaka | | |
| | 57 | (5) | seven times + V. | | | | |
| | | | after each | | | | |
| | 58 | (6) | | | Auddālaki + Bābhravīyāḥ | | |

| Main sections (<i>adhikaraṇa</i>) | Topics (<i>prakaraṇa</i>) | Chapters (<i>adhyaḥya</i>) | The teachers (<i>ācāryāḥ</i>) | Schools | Individual authors | Other references | Self-quotations of Vātsyāyana without debate |
|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------------|---------|------------------------------|------------------|--|
| VII aupaniṣadikam (secret means) | 59 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 60 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 61 | (1) | | | | | |
| | 62 | (2) | | | (Bābhravya + V.) | | |
| | 63 | (2) | | | Bābhravya, V. (in stanza) | | |
| | 64 | (4) | | | | | |

THE QUOTATIONS IN THE ARTHASĀSTRA OF KAUTILYA (OR KAUTILYA)

| | | <i>The teachers (ācāryāḥ)</i> | <i>Schools</i> | <i>Individual authors</i> |
|--------------------|-------------------|-----------------------------------|---|--|
| <i>adhikarāṇas</i> | <i>prakāraṇas</i> | | | |
| I | 1 | once + K. | Mānavāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + Auśanasah + K. | |
| | 4 | | | Bhāradvāja + Viśālākṣa + Parāśara + Piśuna + Kauṇapadanta + Vātavyādhi + Bāhudantīputra + K. |
| | 6 | once + K. (in stanza) | | |
| | 11 | | Mānavāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + Auśanasah + K. | Bhāradvāja + Viśālākṣa + Parāśara + Piśuna + K. |
| | 13 | | Āmbhīyāḥ + K. | Bhāradvāja + Viśālākṣa + Parāśara + Piśuna + Kauṇapadanta + Vātavyādhi + K. |
| II | 25 | | Mānavāḥ + Parāśarāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + Auśanasah + K. | |
| III | 27 | once + K. | | |
| | 59 | once + K. | | |
| | 60 | once + K. | Auśanasah | |
| | | once + apare (others) + K. | | |
| | 63 | | Auśanasah + Mānavāḥ + Bārhaspatyāḥ + K. | |
| | 66 | once + K. | | |
| | 71 | once + K. | Mānavāḥ + Auśanasah + Bārhaspatyāḥ + K. | |

| | <i>adhikarāṇas</i> | <i>prakāraṇas</i> | <i>The teachers (ācāryāḥ)</i> | <i>Schools</i> | <i>Individual authors</i> |
|------|--------------------|-------------------|------------------------------------|----------------|---|
| | | 73 | twice + K. after each | | |
| | | 74 | once + K. | | |
| IV | | 93 | | | <u>Kātyāyana + Kanika Bhāradvāja</u> <u>+ Dirgha Cārāyana + Ghoṭamukha</u> <u>+ Kimjalka + Piśuna + Piśunaputra</u> |
| V | | | | | |
| VI | | 98 | once + Vātavyādhi + K. | | |
| VII | | 99 | once + K. | | |
| | | 103 | once + K. | | |
| | | 108 | twice + K. after each | | |
| | | 112 | once + K. | | |
| | | 116 | fourteen times. + K. after each | | |
| | | 117 | once + K. | | |
| | | 119 | once + K. | | |
| | | 122 | once + K. | | |
| VIII | | 127 | once + K. | | Bhāradvāja + K. + Viśālākṣa + K. + Parāśara + K. + Piśuna + K. + Kaunapadanta + K. + Vātavyādhi + K. |
| | | 128 | four times + K. after each | | |
| | | 129 | | | |
| | | 130 | twelve times + K. after each | | Same form of debate as in VIII, 127 |

| <i>adhikāraṅgas</i> | <i>prakāraṅgas</i> | <i>The teachers (ācāryāḥ)</i> | <i>Schools</i> | <i>Individual authors</i> |
|---------------------|--------------------|--|--|-----------------------------|
| IX | 135 | four times + K. after each eke (some) + eke + K. once + K. | | |
| X | 138 | | | |
| XI | 158 | | Ausanasah + Bārhaspatyāḥ | |
| XII | 162 | | | Bhāradvāja + Viśalākṣa + K. |
| XIII | | | | |
| XIV | | | refers to schools in I, 11 and X, 158 | |
| XV | | | | |

Self-quotations of K. (= Kauṣīlya or Kauṣīlyā) in I, 3; III, 4; VII, 119 and XIII, 174.