INDOLOGICA TAURINENSIA

THE JOURNAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF SANSKRIT STUDIES

VOLUME XXXVIII

2012

EDIZIONI AIT

Publisher: Comitato AIT, corso Trento 13 – 10129 Torino (Italy) Email: irmapiovano@cesmeo.it; info@cesmeo.it

Printer: Edizioni ETS, Pisa (Italy) Annual Subscription (1 issue): € 30,00 Electronic version: www.indologica.com Sole Agents: Comitato AIT

Copyright © 2012 Comitato AIT per la promozione degli Studi sull'India e sul Sud-Est

Irma Piovano (President) - Saverio Sani (Vice President) - Victor Agostini (Secretary). corso Trento 13 - 10129 Torino (Italy)

C.F. 97651370013 – R.E.A. Torino, n. 1048465 – R..O.C., n. 14802

Autorizzazione del Tribunale di Torino N. 4703 del 21/7/1994 I.S.N.N. 1023-3881

CONTENTS

Articles

ASHWINI AGRAWAL	
Śaivism in North-West India: synchronizing numismatic and sigillographic data with epigraphic evidence (c. 400-800 CE)p.	11
SIMON BRODBECK	
On the lineal significance of the Rājasūya in the Mahābhāratap.	27
DANIELLE FELLER	
Epic heroes have no childhood. A survey of childhood descriptions in the Sanskrit epics, the Mahābhārata and the Rāmāyaṇap.	65
LARS GÖHLER	
Ontologische und grammatikalische Elemente im Zeitbegriff von Bhartṛharip.	87
JOANNA JUREWICZ	
Tátaḥ Kṣarati Akṣáram. A history of an abstract notionp.	105

LEONID KULIKOV Text-critical and linguistic remarks on the interpretation of an atharvanic hymn to night: Śaunakīya 19.47 = Paippalāda 6.20p.	123
THOMAS L. MARKEY and JEAN-CLAUDE MULLER	
Days among the meratus Dayak: smoking trees for trinkets or reverberations of Sanskrit in the Jungle of Borneop.	135
JULIETA ROTARU Textual division of the Rātrī Group of hymns in the Atharvavedic ritual traditionp.	191
JUDIT TÖRZSÖK Tolerance and its limits in twelfth century kashmir: tantric elements in Kalhaṇa's Rājataraṇgiṇīp.	211
List of contributorsp.	239
The XV World Sanskrit Conference and the International Association of Sanskrit Studies (I.A.S.S.)	
Report on the Fifteenth World Sanskrit Conferencep.	245
Meetings of the I.A.S.S. during the 15th World Sanskrit Conference held in New Delhip. Minutes of the meeting of the I.A.S.S. Board New Delhi, 5th January 2012	247
Minutes of the meeting of the I.A.S.S. Consultative Committee New Delhi, 6th January 2012 Minutes of the General Assembly of the I.A.S.S.	
New Delhi, 6th January 2012	

Reviews

-	ROSA MARIA CIMINO, Leggende e fasti della Corte dei "Grandi Re": dipinti murali di Udaipur, Rajasthan, Cesmeo, Torino, 2011 (Isabella Nardi)	257
-	JOANNA JUREWICZ, Fire and Cognition in the Rgveda, Warszawa: Elipsa 2010, a book of 485 pages - ISBN 978-83-7151-893-5 (Moreno Dore and Tiziana Pontillo)	263

JULIETA ROTARU

TEXTUAL DIVISION OF THE RATRI GROUP OF HYMNS IN THE ATHARVAVEDIC RITUAL TRADITION

§ 0. Introduction

It has been since long shown (ROTH 1875: 15 ff., BLOOMFIELD 1899: 35 ff.) and recently argumented (GRIFFITHS 2009: Intro., 2.2.1) that the hymns of the 19th kāṇḍa of the Śaunakasamhitā (ŚS) are gathered from the Paippalādasamhitā (PS).

WHITNEY (1905: cxli ff., 895-896) has amply shown the reasons for which the 19th kāṇḍa of the ŚS has been considered an addition to the original nucleus of seventeen books. That the supplemented kāṇḍa has received a treatment that was different from the original nucleus witness also S.P. PANDIT's description of the manuscripts and sources: some of the mss. do not contain this kāṇḍa¹, others have a separate numbering for it²,

 $^{^{1}}$ ms. **B**, from Bāpujī Jīvanrām of Lūṇāvādā omits it together with some hymns from the 20^{th} ; ms. **Cp.** From the Governmental Collection made by Peter Peterson in Bombay, numbers kāṇḍa-s 19^{th} and 20^{th} together and are written by a different hand. S.P. PANDIT assumes that those belonged to another ms. The 18^{th} kāṇḍa ends at leaf 113 and the ms. goes upto leaf 137 with the 20^{th} kāṇḍa. "The conclusion is that the writer did not mean to copy Kāṇḍa XIX, but that after Kāṇḍa XVIII began Kāṇḍa XX which, however, was not finished; and therefore Kāṇḍa XIX and XX were taken from some other MS. and added on to the first XVIII Kāṇḍas." (1895: 14) The ms. is accented least for the 19^{th} kāṇḍa and the kuntāpa sūktas of the 20^{th} ;

² ms. **D** from Deccan College, year 1748, for which S.P. Pandit assumes an older dating. On the first page of the 19th kānda a compliment to a Vaiṣṇava is addressed; ms. **J** from Sundarjī Durgāśankar of Junāgadh. The 19th kānda was written at Āgrā, the first seventeen (and the twentieth, says erroneously S.P. Pandit, whereas the colophon does not mention the

yet others do not preserve the kāṇḍa³, which was probably taken out with intention, as it was not used in their rituals. In addition to this, two instances may be cited pointing to the same conclusion. One of the reciters, Keśava Bhaṭṭa bin Dāji Bhaṭṭa from Māhulī, who was among the best Atharvavedin in Deccan, had an imperfect mastery over the whole 19th book. Another Vaidika consulted by Pandit is Hirālāl Parikshita of Karnālī, near Baroda, who informed the editor of a ms. of the pada text which had at the beginning of the 19th kāṇḍa "a remark made by his ninth ancestor Nagjī, who lived more than two hundred years ago, to the effect that he accented the Padas of that Kāṇḍa after seeing the Svara-Śāstra."

The conclusion of S.P. PANDIT about the readings of the manuscripts and oral tradition of the 19^{th} kanda is:

"Except in the XIXth Kāṇḍa, the traditional readings of the MSS. and Vaidikas, have been generally followed, Sāyaṇa's reading being rarely adopted."

and the principles guiding his editing of this kāṇḍa:

"In the XIXth Kāṇḍa of which I propose to write more at length further on, the tradition preserved by the MSS. appeared imperfect, and preference had often to be given to the reading explained by the commentator." (1895: 16).

The inaccurately transmitted text of the 19th kāṇḍa has been differently emended by ROTH-WHITNEY and S.P. PANDIT, the latter being followed in the same line by VISHVA BANDHU.

place, but only the date) at Anhilpur, and the whole is a Gujarāti ms. The 19th kāṇḍa has another year, 1702, as like the 20th, as against the rest dated 1706; ms. Cs. hailing from Gujarāt and belonging to then Governmental Collection made by Peter PETERSON in Bombay. It has a continuous numbering for the first seventeen kāṇḍa-s, and separate folios newly numbers for the 18th to 20th kāṇḍa-s. However, the 18th kāṇḍa is wanting, having been probably omitted by the owner. (cf. ms. **Sm.** which omits the inauspicious 18th book).

³ ms. E from Deccan College is a fragmentary ms. dated 1541 or 1485). (the 20th book is also absent).

§ 1. Division of the Rātrī Group of Hymns in the Atharvavedic Samhitas

The group of hymns addressing the Night, ŚS 19.47-50, has been equally interpreted in different ways by the above editors. The first hymn numbers in the mss. used by ROTH-WHITNEY 10 stanzas, whereas the Bṛhatsarvānukramaṇī terms it as navakam, being thus emended by S.P. PANDIT on the basis of the reading presented by the major part of the mss.

"The ninth variation [from ROTH-WHITNEY's edition, n. J.R.] occurs in the number of Rks into which the 47th Sūkta of the XIXth Kāṇḍa is divided. I make it of nine Rks instead of ten, which the Berlin Edition has, on the authority of the *Sarvānukramaṇikā* which lays down: ā rātri pārthivam iti catvāri sūktāni | pūrvaṃ navakam uttaraṃ..... maśvānām iti tryavasānā || 10,26. [...] Four hymns beginning with ā rātri pārthivam. The first is made of nine stanzas, the second of six, the middle one made of 10, the last made of 7. The 7th rc is made of three verses." (1905: 24)

However, WHITNEY, in his posthumous monumental translation completed by Charles LANMAN adopts the reading presented by the new anukramaṇī and S.P. PANDIT, of the 7th stanza, with three avasāna-s.

"That is in accordance with the Anukr. [in that it gives six pādas to vs. 7 and makes a total of 9 vss.], and is a decidedly preferable division to that in our text, which was founded on the numbering of our first mss., and it will be followed in translating here. The sense, however, would be still better suited by making vs. 6 of three lines, instead of vs. 7." (1895: 976)

The commentator Sāyaṇa has still another division: the 6^{th} stanza as ekāvasāna, the last two pādas of the same stanza and the first two pādas of the 7^{th} as a dvyavasānā rc, the last four

pādas of the 7th and the first of the 8th as one rc, the last pāda of the 8th and the first pāda of the 9th as one rc, amounting in this way to 10 stanzas. To add more confusion to this, VISHVA BANDHU, who claims to follow S.P. PANDIT, has a different text of Sāyaṇa's commentary on this portion of the 47th hymn of the 19th kānda.

This hymn is found in the Paippalāda as the 20th hymn of the 6th kāṇḍa, which has the norm of nine stanzas per hymn. WHITNEY (1905: 974-977) and GRIFFITHS (2009: 213-223) have amply discussed the parallel readings of the hymn in the two recensions, the latter emphasizing the accuracy of the Paippalāda version. In spite of the Kashmirian division of the hymn into 9 stanzas, the adopted reading is that presented by the Oriya Mss. which have a double daṇḍa after the second avasāna of the 7th rc, making thus the whole hymn of 10 stanzas⁴. However, the translator of PS 6.20 questions the reasons for incorporating this and the next hymn of 6 stanzas addressing the night (PS 6.21= ŚS 19.48) in the *navarcakānḍa*.

For clarification, in the following we shall illustrate the corresponding avasāna-s of the ŚS 19.47.6-9, starting from the text established by S.P. PANDIT (SPP) which has been accepted by WHITNEY in his translation and adopted by the editor LINDENAU of the ROTH-WHITNEY's edition of the ŚS, as compared with the avasāna division in the princeps edition of ROTH-WHITNEY (R-W), Sāyaṇa apud SPP (Sā SPP), Sāyaṇa apud VISHVA BANDHU (Sā VB) and the PS.

(SPP 19.47.6.a=R-W 19.47.6.a, Sā SPP 19.47.6, Sā VB 19.47.6.a, cf. PS 6.20.6) rákṣā mākir no agháśaṃsa īśata mā no duḥśáṃsa īśata |

(SPP 19.47.6.c= R-W 19.47.6.c, Sā SPP 19.47.7.a, Sā VB 19.47.6.c, cf. PS 6.20.7.a) mấ no adyá gávāṃ stenó mấvīnāṃ vṛka īśata ||6||

⁴ V. BHATTACHARYA 1997 and GRIFFITHS 2009.

(SPP 19.47.7.a=R-W 19.47.7.a, Sā SPP 19.47.7.c, Sā VB 19.47.7, cf. PS 6.20.7.c) mấs vānām bhadre táskaro mấ nrạ ấm yātudhānyàḥ |

(SPP 19.47.7.c=R-W 19.47.7c, Sā SPP 19.47.8.a, Sā VB 19.47.8.a, cf. PS 6.20.8.a) paramébhiḥ pathíbhi stenó dhāvatu táskarah |

(SPP 19.47.7.e=R-W 19.47.8.a, Sā SPP 19.47.8c, Sā VB 19.47.8.c, cf. PS 6.20.8.c) páreṇa datvátī rájjuḥ páreṇāghāyúr arṣatu ||7||

(SPP 19.47.8.a=R-W 19.47.8.c, Sā SPP 19.47.8.e, Sā VB 19.47.9.a, cf. PS 6.20.9.a) ádha rātri trṣṭádhūmam aśīrṣấṇam áhim kṛṇu |

(SPP 19.47.8.c=R-W 19.47.9.a, Sā SPP 19.47.9.a, Sā VB 19.47.9.c, cf. PS 6.20.9.c) hánū vrkasya jambháyā stenám drupadé jahi ||8||

(SPP 19.47.9.a=R-W 19.47.9.c, Sā SPP 19.47.9.c, Sā VB 19.47.10.a, cf. PS 6.20.10.a) tváyi rātri vasāmasi svapiṣyā́masi jāgrhí |

(SPP 19.47.9.c=R-W 19.47.10, Sā SPP 19.47.10, Sā VB 19.47.10c, cf. PS 6.20.10.c) góbhyo naḥ śárma yacháśvebhyaḥ púruṣebhyaḥ ||9||

The other two Śaunakin hymns from the Rắtrī group, 19.49 and 19.50, correspond to the two consecutive hymns, 8 and 9 of the 14th book of the PS. According to the commentator Sāyaṇa, the hymns 47-48 form an arthasūkta, a sense hymn and similarly do the hymns 49-50. Most probably Sāyaṇa is influenced by the ritual tradition, which will be explained in the next chapter.

Albeit the fact that this meta-textual division of the Samhitā is peculiar to the ŚS and it seems not to have correspondent in the PS, the ritual tradition of the Paippalādins records the four hymns, 6.20 cum 21, and 14.8 cum 9 in their peculiar sūkta and kaṇḍikā division(s): **ā rātri iṣirā yoṣā** iti dve kaṇḍike sūkte (GRIFFITHS 2003: fn. 225).

§ 2. Rātrī Group of Hymns in the Atharvavedic Ritual Tradition

As it is well known, the 19th book of the ŚS is not recognised by the KauśikaSūtra (KauśS), the ritual book of the Atharvavedins, and merely few verses (33.3; 44.4; 52.5; 59.3; 72.1) from it are employed and quoted sakalapāṭheṇa.

§ 2.1. Atharvaveda Pariśiṣṭa (AVPariś)

The four hymns are employed in AVParis 4.4 and 4.5, and they are precisely mentioned as two hymns⁵ by the latter. The fourth Parisista deals with the offices of the king's chapelain (Purohitakarmāṇi), and prescribes in sequence, 4.4 and 4.5, two rites seeking the king's safety at night⁶. This is a complex ceremony which includes the worship of a dough effigy symbolizing Rātri devatā, rite which is prescribed by the previous parisista, 4.3. The latter rite is the prakrti for the ceremony prescribed by AVParis 4.4 and AVParis 4.5. This rite presents a similarity of contents with that from pişţarātryāḥ kalpaḥ (AVPariś 6), the ceremony of making an effigy out of dough symbolizing the night, fact which conduced Shyam Kishore LAL, in a study on female divinities in hindu mythology and ritual published by CASS in 1980 (p. 130 ff.), and latter on B.R. MODAK (1993: 238 ff.), in his study on Atharvanic parisista-s, to present an amalgamated version of the two parisista-s. However, AVParis 6 does not prescribe the employment of the four Ratri hymns, neither of the kalpaja hymn, as AVParis 4.3 does (v. further § 2.1.1.). That the two sets of parisista-s, AVParis 4.4 and AVParis 4.5, on one hand, and AVParis 6, on the other hand, present two different rites is

⁵ This hesitation might be due to the manuscripts textual transmission, as WHITNEY noticed: "the verses of the artha-sūkta are sometimes numbered through each separate component decad or sūkta, and sometimes through the whole arta-sūkta, the two methods being variously mingled." (1905: cxxxiii).

⁶ B.R. MODAK 1965: 228 enumerates 10 ceremonies performed for the king prescribed in the Pariśişta-s.

sustained by their ritual performance as presented by prayoga (v. further § 3.).

§ 2.1.1. AVPariś 4.3

atha piṣṭamayīm rātrim caturbhir dīpakaiḥ saha / arcitām gandhamālyena sthāpayet tasya cāgrataḥ //1// namas kṛtvā tato rātrim arcayitvā yathāvidhi / dhūpena cā'nnapānena stotreṇa ca samarcayet //2// pāhi mām satatam devi sarāṣṭraṃ sasuhṛjjanam / uṣase nah prayacchasva śāntim ca kṛṇu me sadā / ye tvām prapadyante devi na teṣām vidyate bhayam //3// rātrim prapadye jananīm sarvabhūtaniveśanīm / bhadrām bhagavatīm kṛṣṇām viśvasya jagato niśām //4//⁷ saṃveśanīm saṃyamanīm grahanakṣatramālinīm / prapanno'aham śivāṃ rātrim bhadre pāram aśīmahi //5// yāṃ sadā sarvabhūtāni sthāvarāṇi carāṇi ca / sāyaṃ prātar namasyanti sā māṃ rātry abhirakṣatv iti //6//

Next, having worshiped the Night by means of four kindled lamps. He should install her [effigy] by means of a garland and [should proceed] further. Then, having paid homage to the Night as per the injunction, he should worship [her] with incense, food and beverage, and [this] hymn:

"Protect me always, O goddess; may I be with a country, and with loyal people; hand us over to the Dawn [who] always makes peace.

⁷ This and the next verse are found in RV Khila 10.127.1.3 and 4 (numbered as adhyāya 5, hymn 2 in Kashikar's edition of khilāni), respectively, cf. khila 10.128.3-4 of the RV Āśvalāyanaśakhīyā. The text of the Āśvalāyana RV Khila 10.128 (CHAUBEY's edition 2009) numbers 23 rc. In the general introduction, volume I, CHAUBEY (2009) mentions that he has consulted all the manuscripts used by Dr. Kashikar in his khilāni edition (including the two mss. from Calcutta, Royal Asiatic Society, which were merely referred by the latter, but actually not seen by him). In the critical apparatus of the hymn in question KASHIKAR mentions that the Āśvalāyana recension has important variant readings, one of the manuscripts seen by him numbering 15, another 17 verses. He had two mss. from India Office library of that śākhā, but he says that he had seen others too. It is no clear on which manuscript Dr. B.B. CHAUBEY has based his editing work of the khila 10.128 or if he has reported the various readings of the hymn elsewhere.

Those who take refuge in You, O goddess, do not have any fear!

The Night who is favourable for the whole world, blessed, dark;

I have taken refuge in the beneficent Night, who puts to sleep, who calms down, who wears a garland of the planets and asterisms;

Protect, O auspicious one. May we reach the yonder shore.

Whom all beings, the moving and the stationary alike, always praise in the morning and in the evening, that, O Night, may she secure me completely!"

The injunction to which refers the second pāda of the second śloka is the recitation of the Rātrī hymns, well known in the Atharvanic quarters. The same mantra sequence, namely the four Rātrī hymns and the kalpaja hymn are employed in the rites of AVPariś 4.4 and 4.5, prayoga and Paippalādavivāhādisaṃskārapaddhati.

§ 2.1.2. AVPariś 4.4

ā rātri pārthivam (PS 6.20-21, cf. ŚS 19.47-48) **iṣirā yoṣā** (PS 14.8-9, cf. ŚS 19.49-50) **trāyamāṇa** (PS 19.44.7)⁸ ity rātryāṇi ||1|| **mamo'bhā** (PS 1.40) **mahyam āpa** (ŚS 6.61)⁹ iti sūktābhyām anvālabhya japet ||2|| **yo naḥ sva** iti (PS 10.11)¹⁰ pañcabhiḥ sarṣapāñ juhuyāt ||3|| **yo'smin** (PS 2.24) **yas tvā mātur** (PS 19.28.13) iti dīpena nṛpasyo'pari triṣ parihṛtya praiṣakṛte prayacchet ||4|| **abhayam** (PS 3.35.5, cf. ŚS 19.15.5) ity ṛcā catasraḥ śarkarāḥ pradakṣiṇaṃ pratidiśaṃ kṣipet ||5|| **e'hy**

⁸ PS 19.44.7a reads: trāyamāņe sarvavide, cf. ŚS 6.107.2a trāyamāņe viśvajite. For a clear indication of the mantra the sūtrakāra quotes in AVPariś 4.5.8 the second word also.

⁹ Although this is also the beginning of PS 19.14.7, the hymn denoted by pratīka is ŚS 6.61, because reference is made to the hymn and not to the verse. KauśS 133.2 prescribes this hymn and the previously mentioned one, PS 1.40, to be recited while offering ghee in the fire, in a ritual performed for pacification, when the domestic fire burns one's house. KauśS quotes PS 1.40 and ŚS 6.61 pratīkena, and again PS 1.40 sakalapāthena.

¹⁰ First pāda corresponds to ŚS 1.19.3a, rest is not found in ŚS. The tenor of PS 10.11 is appropriate with the rite.

aśmānam ā tiṣṭhe 'ti (ŚS 2.13.4)¹¹ pañcamīm adhiṣṭhāpayet ||6|| na taṃ yakṣmā (PS 19.24, cf. ŚS 19.38) ai 'tu deva (PS 7.10, cf. ŚS 19.39¹²) iti guggulukuṣṭhadhūpam dadyāt ||7|| yas te gandhas (PS 17.3.4, cf. ŚS 12.1.23-25¹³) tryāyuṣam (PS 2.59.5, cf. ŚS 5.28.7) iti bhūtim prayacchet ||8|| dūṣyā dūṣir asī 'ti (PS 1.57, cf. ŚS 2.11) pratisaram ābadhya ||9|| agnir mā pātu vasubhiḥ purastād¹⁴ (PS 19.37.11) iti śarkarān pradakṣiṇam pratidiśam kṣipet ||10|| bahirniḥ sṛṭyottaren a gatvā bāhyeno'paniṣkramya suhṛde kuryāc chraddadhate kuryāt ||11|| naiśam abhayam karma mausalīputraḥ paiṭhīnasiḥ ||12||

[The mantras] PS 6.20-21, PS 14.8-9, PS 19.44.7 are connected with the [ceremonies for the] night. After having touched [the sacrificer] from behind with the two hymns PS 1.40 and ŚS 6.61, he should recite [these mantras]. With five verses for PS 10.11.1-5 he should offer portions of clarified butter in the fire. After having circumabulated a lamp three times over the king's [head] with PS 2.24 and PS 19.28.13, he should offer the lamp to the one following the instructions. With one verse, PS 3.35.5, he should throw four pebbles in the four directions starting from the north towards the south. He should make him step on the fifth [pebble] with "Come, stand on the stone!" (cf. ŚS 2.13.4). With [the hymns] PS 19.24 and PS 7.10 he should fumigate [him] with [the smoke of] bdellium and Costus speciosus. With [the verses] PS 17.3.4 and PS 2.59.5 he should offer [him] the ashes [of the burnt incense]. He ties an amulet with [the hymn] PS 1.57. With [the verse] PS

¹¹ A mantra of the comon nuptial lore, used with variations in upanayana. V. KAJIHARA (2004: 423 and passim) for the usage of this peculiar verse outside the marriage and initiation ceremonies in the KauśS.

¹² This kuṣṭha hymn is well known in Atharvan quarters long before its inclusion into the Śaunakin collection. WHITNEY, note to Prātiśākya ii.67 c: "[...] I do not regard its occurence as by any means to be taken for an evidence that that book constituted a part of the commentator's Atharva-veda; it is to be explained rather as a slip of his memory in quoting, or as a reading of one of his *kuṣṭha* hymns, differing from that of our text"

¹³Although AVParis quotes by pratīka only the first verse, all three should be understood, on account of KausS 8.7. Dārila ad KausS 24.24 designates them gandhapravada, ,the proclamation of the odours'. Kesava prescribes three kinds of flavours to be used while reciting these three verses: flower, vermillion and sandal paste.
¹⁴ The long pratīka clearly indicates PS 19.37.11, a prayer to deities for protection in all

¹⁴ The long pratīka clearly indicates PS 19.37.11, a prayer to deities for protection in all four quarters. The hymn ŚS 19.17, having the same beginning, cannot be the mantra referred to here, since it belongs to the group of hymns called in the Saunakin tradition asapatna (ŚS 19.16-19, V. further note 17), having a similar portent as PS 19.37.11.

¹⁵ Should pancabhih mean "[he offers] five times"?

19.37.11 he should throw pebbles in the four directions starting from the north towards the south. Having come out, having gone towards the north, and having gone away from the outside, he should perform the rite for the sake of a friend who possesses Faith. This [is] the rite performed in the night for making one fearless, as per Paithīnasi, the son of Mausalī."

By the identification of mantra pratīka, we may assign the rite prescribed by this pariśiṣṭa issued in Paippalādic millieu. The same rite atributed to Mauliputra (sic!) Paiṭhīnasi is compiled along similar others culled from the pariśiṣṭas in a prayoga named Atharvaṇavidhi (ms. SPP 24 in Asiatic Society of Mumbay, catalogued by Malhar KULKARNI 2009)¹⁶. The *rātryāṇi* succinctly prescribed in the beginning of AVPariś 4.4 refers to the prakṛti of AVPariś 4.3.

§ 2.1.3. AVParis 4.5

athā'to rātrisūktānām vidhim anukramiṣyāmaḥ //1// śuciḥ śuklavāsāḥ purohitaḥ //2// pārthivasya (ŚS 2.29) paścimām saṃdhyām upāsya darbhaiḥ pavitrapāṇī rājānam abhigamya /3/ piṣṭamayīm rātrim kṛtvā /4/ annapānadhūpadīpair arcayitvā mālyaiś ca //5// prajvalitaiś caturbhir dīpakair arcayitvā //6// ā rātri pārthivam iṣirā yoṣe 'ti sūktadvayena (ŚS 19.47-48 and 50-49) rātrim upasthāya //7// trāyamāṇe viśvajite (ŚS 6.107.2) ahne ca tve 'ti (ŚS 8.2.20) rājānam pradakṣiṇam triḥ kṛtvā /8/ rājaveśmani dvāre visarjayitvā //9// na taṃ yakṣmā (ŚS 19.38) ai 'tu deva (ŚS 19.39) iti guggulukuṣṭhadhūpaṃ dadyād /10/ yas te gandha (ŚS 12.1.23-25) iti bhūtim abhimantrya /11/ tryāyuṣam (ŚS 5.28.7) iti rājñe rakṣāṃ kṛtvā //12// asapatnam (ŚS 19.16-19)¹⁷ iti śarkarām abhimantryā 'ṅguṣṭhāt pradakṣiṇaṃ pratidiśam kṣipet //13// śāntā dyaur (ŚS 19.9) iti japitvā rājānam vāsagṛhaṃ nayet //14// bhūtinā rakṣām kṛtvā niskramyai /15/ evam evam ahar ahah kuryāt //16//

¹⁶ According to the policy of the Society only one quarter of a manuscript might be copied and issued upon request. Even though, I could not obtain the four folios requested for the past three years.

¹⁷ For the employment of the sequential hymns v. Sāyaṇa ad 19.16. The first two verses 19.16.1-2 are also found as 19.27.14-15.

Therefore I shall expound the procedure of the "Hymns Addressing the Night". The purohita, wearing white and unwashed (i.e. new) garments. [With the hymn] ŚS 2.29, having performed Sāndhya-s sitting in the west, holding Darbha in his hands, he should touch the king from behind [by means of this grass]. He prepares an effigy of dough for the Night. He worships her with food, beverage, incense, flame, and garlands. Having kindled four lamps, the purohita invokes [the deity]. He installs the effigy of the Night by means of the two [sense-]hymns ŚS 19.47-48 and 49-50. He makes the king to circumambulate thrice towards the south with SS 6.107.2 and SS 8.2.20. [The effigy] is disposed off to the door of the palace. [The priest] offers incense of bdellium and Costus speciosus (guggula, kustha and dhūpa) with ŚS 19.38.1 and SS 19.39.1. He consecrates the ashes with SS 12.1.23-25 and makes an amulet which is worn on the king with \$S 5.28.7. Having consecrated the pebbles with asapatna (ŚS 19.16-19), [having turned] to the south a distance of a thumb breadth, he throws the pebbles [towards that direction]. Having muttered [the hymn] SS 19.9, he accompanies the king to his dwelling-house. Having put in an amulet the ashes from the fumigation and having gone out, [the king] should do the same every day.

This is the Saunakin correspondent of the Paippaladic rite attributed to Paithinasi. The purohita, wearing white and new garments, performs Sāndhya-s sitting in the west. Holding Darbha in his hands, he should touch the king from behind by means of this grass. He prepares an idol of dough for Ratrī devatā and worships her with food, beverage, incense, flame, and garlands. Having kindled four lamps, the purohita invokes the deity with a kalpaja hymn quoted by parisista 4.3 in full, and the hymns **ā rātri pārthivam** (ŚS 47-48) and işir**ā yoşa** (ŚS 49-50). The two sense-hymns are quoted by the AVPariś pratīkena: the kalpaja hymn has to be inferred on account of the prakrti rite described in AVParis 4.3. This is the ceremony of installing the Night effigy. As it can be seen in a more elaborated ceremony (AVParis 6), the effigy of the Night deity is worshipped while seated on a throne as a king, in a transfer of authority to and fro, and of the looked-for strength. The four Ratri hymns and the kalpaja hymn offers a number of bandhuta-s for being employed not merely in worshiping the Night, but that Night which is favourable and renders good for the king. To quote some of them: sarāṣṭram ("one possessing a country"), sasuhṛjjanam ("one possessing loyal people") in the kalpaja hymn, vājini ("prize-winner")¹⁸ várcas ("royal splendour")¹⁹ at 19.49.4b, stómasya no vibhāvari' rātri rājeva joṣase ("Enjoy our invocation, O shining Night, as a king") at 19.49.6a-b, sárvavīrā ("possessing all heroes") at 19.49.4c, śivām rātrim ah(u)vi sūráyas ca ("I have summoned the friendly night; also the lords")²⁰ at 19.49.5a, etc.

§ 2.2.1. AVParis 6.1-2

om athā 'tha piṣṭarātryāḥ kalpam vyākhyāsyāmaḥ //1// ahatavāsāḥ purastāt talpasya gomayena sthaṇḍilam upalipya /2/ ahatavastreṇa simhāsanam avachādya //3// yām devāh prati nandantī 'ti (ŚS 3.10.2) rātrim āvāhavet //4// samvatsarasva pratimām iti (ŚS 3.10.3) pistamayīm pratikrtim krtvo 'danmukhīm upaveśayet //5// chattram hiranmayam dadyād āsanam ca hiranmayam / dadyāc śubhrāni vāsāmsi śubhram cai 'vā 'nulepanam //6// śubhram annam tathā dadyāt prabhūtāms cai 'va modakān / dhūpam ca vividham nityam pradīpāms ca prakalpayet //7// ā mā puşte ca poşe ce 'ty (ŚS 3.10.7) etābhir upasthāya //8// rakşoghnair mantraih sarşapān abhimantrya /9/ āvatas ta (ŚS 5.30) iti japan samantāt talpasyā 'vakīrya /10/ ayam pratisara iti (ŚS 8.5) pratisaram ābadhya śarkarān pratidiśam kṣipet //11// dhūpasesam rājne dadvād //12// abhavapradam karma //13// pascāt sarveşu koneşu dvimukhīm ekamukhīm vā / sarvato vijayām rakṣām ekām vā teṣu caturmukhīm //14// ekamukhīm vā sarvatrā 'pratirathajapa ity eke /15/ sarvatra śarkarāksepaś ceti //16// grhītvā pistarātrim tu veśmadvāre visarjayet /1/ vanaspatir aso madhya²¹ iti guggulukuşthadhūpam dadyād /2/ yas te gandha iti (ŚS

¹⁸ GRIFFITHS 2009: 216 ff.

¹⁹ KULIKOV 2009: 9ff.

²⁰ Thus emended and translated by INSLER 1970: 144 ff. KULIKOV 2009: 12 retains his emendation *ah(u)vi*, but rejects the second emendation, *sūryaṁ ca* to *sūráyas ca*, which he founds unlikely from the syntactic and semantic point of view, whereas *sūryaṁ ca* meaning "sun" or "day" would allude to the alternation day-night which is referred to in many other instances in the Rắtrī hymns (47.2; 48.2; 49.1; 49.4; 49.5; 49.6; 50.7).

²¹ cf. vanaspatir madhumām astu RV 1.90.8.

12.1.23-25) bhūtim abhimantrya /3/ **tryāyuṣam** iti (ŚS 5.28.7) rājñe rakṣām kṛtvā /4/ 6.2.5 (cf. 4.5.13) /5/ **asapatnam** (ŚS **19.16-19**) iti śarkarān abhimantryā 'nguṣṭhād abhipradakṣiṇam pratidiśam kṣipet // 6 // **śāntā dyaur** iti (ŚS 19.9) japitvā rājānam vāsagṛham nayet // bhūtinā rakṣām kṛtvā niṣkramyaī /7/ evamevam ahar ahaḥ kuryād iti piṣṭarātryāḥ kalpaḥ samāptaḥ //8//

Om, we shall now speak of the ceremony of making an effigy out of dough symbolizing the night. [The priest, wearing] new cloths [seats] at the east of the bed, [and] after having besmeared the sacrificial platform with cow-dung, covers the throne with a new cloth. He should adore the Night with [the verse] ŚS 3.10.2. Having made a counter dough effigy he should seat facing North, [reciting the verse] ŚS 3.10.3.

He should offer a golden umbrella and a golden chair; he should offer glamorous cloths and glamorous scented oil; excellent food he should also offer, and numerous sweets. Various incenses, and he should fabricate compulsory torches; He should worship with these and [with the hymn] ŚS 3.10.7.

[The priest] consecrates the mustards seeds with mantras destroying the demons (ŚS 8.3.4). He scatters [the mustards seeds] around the bed [with the hymn] ŚS 5.30²². [With the hymn] ŚS 8.5²³ he ties on the amulet [and] throws pebbles in every direction. He should offer to the king the incense and the other [items]. This rite is yielding courage. Afterwards he should throw pebbles in all corners in a race or protection from two quarters or from one quarter, or from all sides in a race or protection from four quarters, or, according to some, everywhere reciting the hymn **apratiratha**²⁴ in a race or protection from one quarter. Having grasped the night effigy, he should leave [it] on the mansion's doors. [With the

 $^{^{22}}$ It is used by KauśS 58.11 in a ceremony for lengthening the life span. It is recorded by AVPariś 32.9 in ayusyagana.

²³ The hymn addresses an amulet made of sraktya, glossed by the commentators as tilaka (Clerodendrum Phlomoides). It is employed by KauśS 19.22 among other hymns in a rite for begetting prosperity, for accompanying the binding of an amulet after having kept it in honey and milk for three nights beginning with the thirteenth day of the latter half of the month (cf. KauśS 7.19).

²⁴ "Having unconquerable chariots", this is the famous hymn addressed to Indra, RV 10.103, found also as SS 19.13.

mantra] "In the sap of Vanaspati"²⁵ he should offer bdellium, kuṣṭha, and incense. [With the verses] ŚS 12.1.23-25²⁶ he should consecrate the fumigation. [With the hymn] ŚS 5.28.7²⁷ he should make an amulet for the king. Having consecrated the pebbles [with the hymn] ŚS 19.16, having turned to the south a distance of a thumb breadth, he should throw [them] all around. Having recited ŚS 19.9²⁸, he should accompany the king to his dwelling apartments. Having placed in an amulet the ashes of the fumigation and having gone out, he should do the same every day, thus is the ceremony of making an effigy out of dough symbolizing the night.

The rite is performed night time in the king's bedroom in order to avert his fear. The Night is worshiped with offerings of golden objects, cloths, scented oil, food, sweets, various incenses, with the recitation of appropriate Saunakin mantras. In the end the king receives the thus consecrated offerings, in a transfer of divine authority, while the effigy of Night deity is disposed off on the mansion's doors, and the priests fumigates the premises with incense of bdellium and Costus speciosus. In the economy of the rite, the usage of various incenses and of golden objects are in full consonance with the meaning of the mantras recited, in a scenario of making believe the dreadful Night is therein physically present and partakes of the offerings without the support of which it is again relegated to imagination.

²⁵ This unidentified mantra is also employed by AVPariś 20.3.3. As shown previously in the parallel reading from AVPariś 4.5.10, the hymn prescribed is ŚS 19.38. According to Sāyaṇa the next hymn also, 39, addressing the kuṣṭha plant is used in this rite.

²⁶V. KauśS 8.7; Dārila ad KauśS 24.24. V. also note 13.

 $^{^{27}}$ Three other verses of this hymn are prescribed by KauśS 58.11 in a ceremony for lengthening the life span.

²⁸ The hymn belongs to śāntigaņa.

§ 3. Prayogas Saṃskāraratnamālā (SRM) and Pragogabhānu (PraBhā), and Paippalādavivāhādisaṃskārapaddhati

The unpublished late prayoga Samskāraratnamālā, hailing from Gore collection from Vaidika Samśodhana Maṇḍala, Pune²⁹, quotes with some originality and expands the pariśiṣṭa-s 4.5 and 6.1-2, being, as far as I know, the only Atharvanic pariśiṣṭa-s for which we get the ritual employment. Prayoga prescribes both the rites of the pariśiṣṭa-s following the birth and the jātakarma, hence the prayogakāra omits very carefully the words alluding to the king. The SRM text has adapted the ceremony against the Night evils attacking a new born child, purport which bears a special significance for the socio-cultural milieu in which SRM has been copied or compiled.

The prayogakāra compiles with some originality the pariśiṣṭa 4.5 as *rātrisūktanām vidhiḥ* ("The Procedure of the Hymns Addressing the Night"), and quite faithfully the pariśiṣṭa 6. as *piṣṭarātryāḥ kalpaḥ* ("The Ceremony of Making a Dough Effigy"). The latter is quite closely reproduced, and all the hymns prescribed in the pariśiṣṭa are also found adequately employed by the prayogakāra.

On the contrary, as for the rite prescribed by the parisista 4.5, in the prayoga we get another version. In short, the prayogakāra preserves the purport of the rite as in the parisista, although the beneficiary is not the king but the new born child. The ceremony consists in the mere recitation of the four Rātrī hymns and the kalpaja hymn, besides some śāntisūktāni, which, however, are different from the two śāntigaṇa-s mentioned by KauśS 9.1-2 and 9.4 as bṛhacchāntigaṇa and laghuśāntigaṇa, and by the other two referred to by the Gaṇamālā. The four hymns addressing the Night are enumerated by the parisista as follows: ŚS 19.47; 48; 49, and 50. It is very interesting why the four Rātrī hymns are mentioned only pratīkena, since as per the

²⁹ Ms. accession number 4290, hand-written catalogue.

prayoga style, the hymns are first referred by pratīka and then quoted in full.

Similarly, another AVic prayoga called Pragogabhānu³⁰, and composed by Raviśańkara Dviveda towards the end of the 18th c. and used by Atharvavedin communities in Gujarat, quotes by pratīka the hymn ŚS 19.47, called Rātrisūktam, in a rite for obtaining safety for one who wishes to eat at night. We have to infer all four hymns, 19.47-50 under this generic name, Rātrisūktam.

The recently complied Paippalādavivāhādisaṃskārapaddhati, by the Orya scholar UMĀKĀNTA PAŅDĀ, prescribes the worshipping of Rắtrī with the employment of the kalpaja hymn and the other four, quoted sakalapāṭheṇa. UMĀKĀNTA PAŅDĀ gives in parenthesis the Śaunakin variant readings, which are, of course, less accurate than those of the PS. His hymn PS 6.20 (=ŚS 19.47) has 9 stanzas and the same divisions as in the ŚS mss., viz. with three avasānas in the 7th stanza, division most probably contaminated from the ŚS edition which he uses³¹.

Now regarding the kalpaja hymn quoted in all ritual sources, Śaunakin and Paippalādic alike, two of its verses, 4 and 5, are found in the khilas of the RV in both recensions, without variae lectiones (RV Khila 10.127.1.3 and 4, respectively, cf. khila 10.128.3-4 of the so called RV Āśvalāyanaśakhīyā). A manuscript from University of Pennsylvania University Library Catalogue no. 13, entered as no.24 in POLEMAN, contains Rātrisūkta of the RV (10.127), 15 rc of the khila 10.128 of the RV Āśvalāyanaśakhīyā, and one verse of RV 7.104.22, all numbered continuously. The title in the beginning and in the colophon is Rātrisūkta (sic!). It is very probable that these texts were thus clumped for the ritual purpose. Similarly,

³⁰ A copy of the ms. deposited in Lalbhai Dalpathibhai Indology Institute, Ahmedabad, was obtained through courtesy of prof. Bahulkar.

 $^{^{31}}$ Shilpa Sumant has informed me that UMĀKĀNTA PAŅDĀ quite frequently uses the Śaunakīya collection. (v. also WITZEL 1985b).

RAGHAVAN (1978: 274) refers to a manuscript from Sarasvati Mahal, Tanjavur (TD 329) containing the viniyoga of the Rātrisūkta, which amasses RV 9.127 and its khila.

Similarly, the two apocryphal Rgvedic verses and other four Ratri hymns were circulating in the pan-Atharvavedic ritual tradition. When the Paippaladins have included those in their Samhita, they might have worked some redaction and corrections. Yet it is unanswerable, GRIFFITHS thinks, why they have included them in a book having the norm of 9 stanzas per hymn. A possible answer may be given as follows:

Bahulkar cites Vasudevaśāstri Pañcoli, from Sinore, Gujarat, in connection with the fact that some Atharvavedins leaving nowadays in Gujarat call themselves as paippalādins, although they study the ŚS and the Śaunakin ancillary texts. "Their original śākhā has survived only in their memory" (1994: 2), concludes the author pointing at the original home of the paippalādins (v. WITZEL 1985a).

Mutatis mutandis, the division of the hymn 6.20 into 9 stanzas has survived only in the Paippalādins' memory. The hymn 6.21 was added due to the similarity of contents with the previous one and their being employed together in the ritual tradition, as we have seen in AVPariś 4.4 which is a multi-śākhā text describing a ritual issued in Paippalādic millieu.

§ 4. Conclusion

As it is well known, the hymns from the 19th book of the ŚS are not employed by the KauśS, so we do not know its ritual employment. Yet, the AVPariś 4.5 employs the hymns ŚS 19.47-48 cum ŚS 19.49-50 as two arthasūkta-s in a rite seeking the king's safety at night. The AVPariś 4.5 prescribes a similar rite issued in Paippalādic circles, and employs the two corresponding hymns, PS 6.20-21 cum PS 14.8-9, thus acknowledging the kaṇḍikā meta-textual division of the PS which is referred to in a later Paippalādic text (v. GRIFFITHS 2003: fn. 225). The pariśiṣṭa 4.5 is paraphrased by latter

Śaunakin prayoga (unpublished, belonging to the collection of the Atharvanic priests Gore of Sānglī, donated to Vaidika Samśodhana Maṇḍala, Pune).

It seems clearly to me that the ŚS and the Śaunaka ritual tradition preserves the original division of 19.47 in 9 stanzas, which might have been known to the Paippalādins as well before introducing it in their collection. The division of the hymn PS 6.20 into 9 stanzas has survived only in the Paippalādins' memory. It might be likely that the Śaunakins have entered the hymn 19.47 into their collection via a pan-Atharvavedic ritual tradition and have not necessarily borrowed it from the PS.

The mass of portentous corruptions in ŚS 19.47, as like in the whole 19th book, may be explained by deficient oral transmission, through the fact that this hymn and book has been lately added to the main nucleus, whereas it has entered into the PS quite early (or benefited of another diaskeuasis?).

Bibliography

- BAHULKAR, S. Shrikant. 1994. *Medical Ritual in the Atharvaveda Tradition*. Shri Balmukund Sanskrit Mahavidyalaya Research Series No.8, Pune: Tilak Maharashtra Vidyapeeth.
- BHATTACHARYA, Dipak. 1997. *The Paippalāda Saṃhitā of the Atharvaveda*. Vol. 1: Consisting of the first fifteen Kāṇḍas / Ed. By D. BHATTACHARYA. Bibliotheca Indica 318, Calcutta.
- BLOOMFIELD, Maurice. 1899. *The Atharvaveda*. Grundriss der Indo-Arischen Philologie und Altertumskunde Vol.II, Part I, B, Strassburg: Von Karl J. Trübner, first edition [reprinted as *The Atharvaveda and the Gopatha Brāhmaṇa*, New Delhi: Asian Publication Services, 1978].
- BOLLING, George Melville and Julius von NEGELEIN (eds.). 1909. *The Parisistas of the Atharvaveda*, Leipzig: Otto Harrassowitz.
- CHAUBEY, Braj Bihari. 2009. Āśvalāyana-Samhitā of The Rgveda (With Padapāṭha, Detailed Introduction and two Indices), 2 vols.,

- Edited by B.B. CHAUBEY, New Delhi: Indhira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts.
- GRIFFITHS, Arlo. 2003. "The Textual Divisions of the Paippalāda samhitā." *Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens*, 47, 5-35.
- ———. 2009. The Paippalādasaṃhitā of the Atharvaveda, Kāṇḍas 6 to 7, A new Edition with Translation and Commentary, Groningen: Egbert Forsten.
- INSLER, Stanley. 1970. "Sanskrit *táskara* and text criticism to AV xix 47-50." *Die Sprache*, 138-148.
- KAJIHARA, Mieko. 2004. "The Upanayana and Marriage in the Atharvaveda." In *The Vedas. Texts, Language & Ritual. Proceedings of the Third International Vedic Workshop, Leiden 2002*, ed. Arlo GRIFFITHS and Jan E.M. HOUBEN, Groningen Oriental Studies XX, Groningen: Egbert Forsten, 417-432.
- KASHIKAR, C.G and N.S. SONTAKKE (eds.) 1983. *Rgveda-Samhitā with the commentary of Sāyaṇācārya*, vol. IV (Maṇḍalas IX-X) [second edition; first edition 1946], Pune: Vaidika Samśodhana Mandala.
- KULIKOV, Leonid. 2009. Заметки по ведийской морфологии и синтаксису: к анализу атхарванического гимна ночи (Шаунакия 19.49 = Пайппалада 14.8) = Zametki po vedijskoj morfologii i sintaksisu: k analizu atharvaničeskogo gimna noči (aunakija 19.49 = Pajppalada 14.8) [Notes on the Vedic morphology and syntax: An analysis of the atharvanic hymn to the Night (Śaunakīya 19.49 = Paippalāda 14.8)]. Восток / Oriens, Афро-азиатские общества: история и современность (Vostok (Oriens), Afro-aziatskie objestva: istoria i sovremenosti), May-June, 3, Russian Academy of Sciences, Institute of Oriental Studies and Institute of African Studies, Moskva: Nauka, 5-16.
- KULKARNI, Malhar. 2009. "A Primary Information about the S.P. Pandit Collection of Manuscripts." In Śrīnidhiḥ, Professor S.S. Bahulkar's Gratitude Volume, Shripad BHAT, Shilpa SUMANT, Ambarish KHARE (eds.), Pune: Saṃvidyā Institute of Cultural Studies, 523-534.
- LAL, Shyam Kishore. 1980. Female Divinities in Hindu Mythology and Ritual. Centre of Advanced Study in Sanskrit Series, Class B, no.7, Pune: University of Pune.
- MODAK, B. R. 1965. "Royal ceremonies in Atharva- Pariśiṣṭas." Summary of Papers of the 22nd AIOC: 218-29

- PAŅŅĀ, UMĀKĀNTA. 2000.
 - Paippalādavivāhādisaṃskārapaddhati, Balasore. [s.ed.]
- PANDIT, Shankar Pandurang (ed.). 1895. *Atharvaveda saṃhitā with the Commentary of Sāyaṇācārya*, edited by S.P. Pandit, Vol. 1, (1st edn. Bombay 1895) reprint 1989, Krishnadas Sanskrit Series 109, Varanasi: Krishnadas Academy.
- POLEMAN, Horace Irvin. 1938. *Census of Indic manuscripts in the United States and Canada*, compiled by H. I. POLEMAN. reprint: New York: Kraus Reprint Corp. 1967 [first edition New Haven: American oriental society, 1938].
- RAGHAVAN, V. 1978. "Rātri and Rātri Sūkta." Purānam 20 (2): 268-275.
- ROTH, Rudolph. 1875. *Der Atharvaveda in Kaschmir*. Tubingen : Laupp.
- VISHVA BANDHU. 1962. Atharvaveda (Śaunaka) with the Padapātha and Sāyaṇācārya's commentary/ Ed. by VISHVA BANDHU et al. Part IV. Vishveshvaranand Indological Series 16. Hoshiarpur: Vishveshvaranand Vedic Research Institute.
- WHITNEY, William Dwight (ed.) 1862. Atharvaveda-Prātiśākhya or Śaunakīya Caturādhyāyikā. JAOS 7. New Haven: American Oriental Society.
- ——— (tr.). 1905. Atharvavedasamhitā, translated into English with Critical and Exegetical Commentary by W. D. WHITNEY, revised and edited by Charles Rockwell LANMAN, Vol. I, 1st edn. 1905. Harvard Oriental Series, Vol. VII, Cambridge, Mass., 5th reprint 1996, New Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers Pvt. Ltd.
- WHITNEY-ROTH. 1855. *Atharva Veda Sanhita* / Herausgegeben von R. ROTH und W. D. WHITNEY. Erste Abtheilung, Berlin: Ferd. Dümmler.
- WHITNEY-ROTH. 1924. *Atharva Veda Samhita* / Herausgegeben von R. ROTH, W. D. WHITNEY. Zweite Abtheilung, verbesserte Auflage besorgt von M. LINDENAU. Berlin: Ferd. Dümmler.
- WITZEL, Michael. 1985a. "Die mündliche Tradition der Paipplādins von Orissa." Festgabe für Karl Hoffmann, Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft 44, München, 259-89.